

Item 20

A319 BAGSHOT ROAD JUNCTION BENNER LANE & CHURCH ROAD, WEST END

SURREY COUNTY COUNCIL'S LOCAL COMMITTEE IN SURREY HEATH

22th July 2004

KEY ISSUE:

To seek approval to make a permanent Traffic Regulation Order for the closure of Church Road, West End at its junction with A319 Bagshot Road and Benner Lane, together with the implementation of the safety scheme. This follows a six-month trial of a physical layout under an Experimental Traffic Order, which has allowed traffic data to be collected and evaluated.

SUMMARY:

The Local Committee in July 2003 received a report relating to the improvement scheme at A319 Bagshot Road j/w Benner Lane and Church Road. The report set out the work being undertaken with regard to land acquisition and that of the proposal to implement an experimental road closure. An Experimental Order has since been in place allowing consideration of the effects of displaced traffic in the area, together with an appreciation of the impact on the junction such a proposal would have.

A decision on the Recommendation at the Local Committee on 29 April 2004 was deferred allowing for a further period of consultation. This has now taken place and referred to within this report.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATIONS:

That the Local Committee in Surrey Heath:

- i) give approval to make a Traffic Regulation Order in accordance with the Traffic Regulation Act 1984 to permanently close Church Road as trialled and defined in the proposed scheme for the junction with Benner Lane and the A319; and
- ii) that the approved safety improvement scheme be implemented at the earliest practicable time subject to land acquisition.

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

- 1. The Local Committee on 16th October 2003 gave consent to implement an experimental closure of Church Road at its junction with A319 Bagshot Road and Benner Lane. The experimental order was proposed to consider the effects of displaced traffic in the area following discussions with the Police. The experimental closure was implemented on 27 October 2003 (date of Order) for a period of 18 months, and within the first 6 months of the closure, objections and representations were invited.
- 2. The Committee Report of 29 April 2004 detailed the analysis of the traffic survey data both before and after the experimental closure was implemented and concluded the permanent scheme would meet the objectives of improving safety.
- 3. The scheme had already received Approval by the SCC Transportation Sub-Committee on 24 November 1999 to progress detailed design. The current experimental closure has enabled data to be gathered as to the nature of displaced traffic rather than an opportunity to re-design the scheme at the junction.
- 4. Further to representations made by residents both at the Committee meeting and within the report, the Committee deferred making a decision on the scheme and agreed an area to consult further. The results of the consultation were to be reported to the next appropriate Committee.

CONSULTATION

- 5. Letters of consultation were sent to resident in the vicinity of the Bagshot Road/Benner Lane junction including properties in Bagshot Road, Church Lane, Benner Lane, Windlesham Road and Sheets Heath Lane on 20 May 2004.
- 6. Representations and objections to the proposal have been received from residents consulted, together with other residents beyond the consultation area. The table shown on Annex 1 is a précis of the formal objection points raised, and the associated comments from the LTS. Comments raised previously are included in the 29 April 2004 report, but all comments received since that we are aware of are included in Annex 1. (For clarity, the petition referred to in the 29 April 2004 report [Item 2, Mr J E Smith Petition and letter] contained approximately 150 signatures with no addresses).
- 7. Of the SCC consultation of the 20 May 2004, 2 letters are clearly in response to this letter. The other correspondence may be a reply to the SCC 20 May 2004 consultation or generated independently. Approximately the first 75 replies listed are a standard letter signed by separate residents. The consultation letter of 20 May 2004 explained the history and Committee Approvals for this scheme by Surrey County Council. Replies to this consultation letter will have been by respondents aware of the relevant facts relating to the scheme and been able to reply accordingly.

- 8. The majority of the letters received (75 identical) appear to be returned randomly far beyond the area of the 20 May 2004 consultation. These respondents may not all have been aware of all the facts explained in the SCC letter. The letters received are shown on Annex 2.
- 9. In addition the LTS is not aware of the circumstances as to how the locally generated letters were distributed and what information was provided. The letter provides a simple method to object, but no method at all to support. On this basis the locally generated letter could represent those residents who object or felt obliged to object. All the remaining residents on all the roads on which an approach may have been made and may not have been offered a similar letter to support the scheme, could be considered as not wanting to object. These could represent the remaining majority of other properties.
- 10. The majority of replies appear to prefer a roundabout alternative, but due to the apparent distribution of locally generated letters which could potentially mislead or not offer balanced information, many of the objections may be based on inaccurate advice. The level of true objections could therefore be in doubt. It has not therefore been possible to gauge the response accurately from the from the LTS 20 May consultation due to canvassing method.
- A letter from Mr R W Crow of 6 July 2004 was received on 6 July 2004 with a summary of results of a straw poll survey undertaken at a meeting of local residents on 20 May 2004. The survey was taken from data collected from a handout that listed a number of schemes residents could tick if supportive (The format of the questionnaire and the method which information was collected was not progressed in liaison with the LTS office). Their results are as follows:

	Number at meeting	91
	Number of completed forms	42
1	Meeting votes for roundabout A319 Benner Lane	57
2	Meeting votes against roundabout at A319	9
	Benner Lane	
3	30mph in West End	33
4	Forms roundabout at A319 Windlesham Rd	31
5	Number for roundabout at West End War Memorial	17
7	Number for width restriction in Windlesham Road	20
		22
8	20mph past Holy Trinity School	33
9	No for 30mph Halebourne Lane	9

Item 6 not listed in data supplied

12. The results of their survey would appear to repeat comments made in letters received in Annex 1, and list other schemes (in no order of priority) of other desirable schemes for the village. It is unclear why some results

- refer to 'meeting votes' and others do not. The returned survey forms do not contain names or addresses, it is therefore unclear as to whether the respondents are already included in Annex 1.
- 13. Providing an alternative roundabout at the junction was estimated by Mr Crow at the meeting at £180,000. The estimated cost of the current proposal is £120,000 and the current estimate of a similar roundabout proposed at A322 Guildford Road/Hen&Chicks is £780,000. This type of information could be misleading.
- 14. The meeting is listed to have been attended by 91 people, although unsolicited reports indicate there were no more than 50, of which about 5 left before voting. Counting of votes would appear to have been confused and the figures provided may therefore be unreliable.
- 15. A further joint letter from Mr J E Smith and Mr R Crow of 22 June 2004, titled Campaign for a Safer West End' (included in Annex 1), would appear to represent the stance of the 75 residents who returned their locally generated letter. The A322 Task Group was set up to include making the villages such as West End safer, and from this the current proposal resulted. Mr Smith, Mr Crow and the 75 residents are in effect supporting a safety improvement scheme. The difference is in the basic design approach, even though a roundabout option was discontinued 5 years ago.
- 16. All views currently available are as far as the LTS is aware are included in this report, or the report of 29 April 2004.
- 17. Consultations have taken place previously with local Borough Council Members and West End Parish Council, who have given their support to both the experimental and permanent schemes.

ANALYSIS AND COMMENTARY

- 18. The Experimental Traffic Order made on 16 October 2003 provides an opportunity for representations to be made within 6 months of the date of the Order, i.e. to the 16 April 2004.
- 19. Two accidents have occurred during the period of the experiment in the vicinity of A319 Bagshot Road/Windlesham Road junction. One on 24 November 2003 (fatality) involved a pedestrian crossing the A319, the other a vehicle turning around at the junction, turning out of Windlesham Road. The indications so far are that neither of these incidents are attributable to the experimental closure, or other highway defect.
- 20. As of 12 July 2004 no other personal injury accidents of which the LTS is aware, were recorded by Surrey Police since the introduction of the experimental scheme, in the vicinity of the A319 Bagshot Road with its junctions with Benner Lane or Windlesham Road, or on the residential roads south of Bagshot Rd and east of Guildford Road, West End.

- 21. Bagshot Road 40mph Speed Limit Order came into effect on 28 May 2004. The length includes Bagshot Road, Gordons School Roundabout, and the A322 Guildford Road between A319 and High Street.
- 22. Once a permanent scheme is completed and permanent traffic patterns have settled, further traffic surveys will be undertaken to ensure any additional measures can be considered for subsequent implementation.
- 23. Windlesham Road has recently benefited from a new footway alongside part of the road and a new lighting scheme will be implemented later this year. In the intervening time the LTS will also look again at the junction of the A319 Bagshot Road/Windlesham Road as to what measures could assist with safer manoeuvres at this junction, together with measures that would help assist with safety along Windlesham Road towards the village.
- 24. Gordons School are currently reviewing their access arrangements and have been liasing with Surrey Heath LTS on potential changes. They are also progressing towards a Travel Plan in line with the County's Safe Routes to School Initiative. Surrey Heath LTS will continue this liaison and progress any improvements that benefit this initiative both for the school and local residents in West End, which could include improvements in Windlesham Road and Benner Lane.
- 25. The current accident statistics therefore continue to re-affirm the experimental scheme has reduced accidents at the A319 Bagshot Road/Benner Lane junction to zero with no increase in accidents elsewhere.
- 26. The permanent scheme is likely to continue this trend and overcome the accident problem that previously existed at this junction. A roundabout option, albeit desired by many residents, has already been considered and rejected as previously indicated. This was on the basis of cost, difficulty providing suitable pedestrian facilities and introducing additional traffic onto Benner Lane and Church Road.

CONCLUSION

- 27. The current proposed scheme has previously been approved by the Transporation Sub-Committee. It is accepted that the scheme is an integral part of the A322/A319 improvements to ameliorate the impact of the loss of the West End/Bisley by-pass.
- 28. The level of support indicated by written responses received following the exhibition was significantly high, and the current scheme was taken forward. The trial scheme reflects the projection of a reduced personal injury accident level for the permanent scheme (no personal injury accidents have occurred at the junction, and there have been no accidents within the residential roads that some traffic may have diverted to).
- 29. The responses received recently support the concept of a 'Safer West End' whilst indicating a preference for a roundabout scheme. A roundabout option

was investigated and subsequently dropped over 5 years ago. The reasons have not changed. As such the current approved scheme should be implemented without delay for the benefit and safety of the West End residents and traveling public.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

30. The funding allocated in 2003/04 is to be carried forward to 2004/05 for the permanent scheme development and construction.

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IMPLICATIONS

31. Surrey has embraced the concept of sustainable development, which is the foundation of Surrey's Local Transport Plan and is committed to the vision of making Surrey a better place. Funding from the integrated transport budget will be expended on projects and schemes in line with this vision whilst fulfilling its key commitments.

CRIME & DISORDER IMPLICATIONS

32. There are no Crime & Disorder Implications.

EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

33. Throughout the scheme development process the Local Transportation Service will assess the opportunities and constraints of pedestrian mobility impairment with the aim of achieving the best possible outcomes whilst having regard for budget and practicality. A trained officer also assesses relevant schemes and consults with the local disabled access group (DASH) regarding any potential difficulties.

Report by: lan Haller, Principal Engineer - Surrey Heath Local

Transportation Service.

LEAD/CONTACT OFFICER: Ian Haller, Principal Engineer

TELEPHONE NUMBER: 01483 518276

BACKGROUND PAPERS: Local Committee report 29 April 2004.

Version No.	Date:	Time:	Initials:	No of annexes:
1	12/7/04	09:20	ILH	2

ANNEX 1
A319 BAGSHOT ROAD j/w BENNER LANE & CHURCH ROAD, WEST END
TABLE OF COMMENTS ON EXPERIMENTAL SCHEME

Name	Comment	Response
Mr R Glazier	Object to current experiment,	Various options were
3 Birch Lane	roundabout would be a better	proposed at the exhibitions
	solution as it would re-open	and the safest option is the
	Church Road and relieve	current scheme, which also
	congestion on minor roads in	introduces a safer opportunity
	village	for pedestrians to cross.
Mr J A Putley	As above	As above
17 Gosden Road		
Mr J Cheeseman	As above	As above
3, Hollybank		
Mr R Wilson	As above	As above
39, Streets Heath		
Mr D Price	As above	As above
Lavender Cottage		
Fairfield Lane		
Mr & Mrs	As above	As above
Donegan		
20, Streets Heath		
Mr Sadler	As above	As above
The Rowans		
Streets Heath		
Mrs Ware	As above	As above
Kirkstone		
Brentmoor Road		
Mr Holt	As above	As above
46, Windsor Court		
Mr Ware	As above	As above
Kirkstone		
Brentmoor Road		
Mrs Chown	As above	As above
31, Meadow Way		
Mr Sirant	As above	As above
West End		
Mr Few	As above	As above
9, Rubus Close		
Mr Thorpe	As Above	As Above
Tringham Hall		
Benner Lane		
Mr Powney	As Above	As Above
25, Benner Lane		
Mr Smith	As Above	As Above
20, Benner Lane		

Mrs Powney	As Above	As Above
25, Benner Lane		
Mr Kessell	As Above	As Above
Mr Crow	As Above	As Above
Silver Birches		
Bagshot Road		
Major Robinson	As Above	As Above
256, Guildford Rd		
Mr J Donald	As Above	As Above
Mr Holmes	As Above	As Above
The Nook		
Brentmoor Road		
Mr Barclay	As Above	As Above
19, Meadow Way		
Mr Farmery	As Above	As Above
43, Meadow Way		
Mr Wallis	As Above	As Above
29, Meadow Way		
Mr Gubbins	As Above	As Above
20, Ashley Way		
Mr Jordan	As Above	As Above
12, Broad Street		
Mrs King	As Above	As Above
Fenns Lane		
Mrs Farmery	As Above	As Above
43, Meadow Way		
Mr & Mrs Bell	As Above	As Above
Mr Crew	As Above	As Above
7, Windlesham		
Road		
Mr Price	As Above	As Above
The Inn@West		
End		
Mr O'Donovan	As Above	As Above
West End PO		
Mr Osborn	As Above	As Above
4, Common Fields		
Mrs Bradley	As Above	As Above
1, Brentmoor		
Road		
Mrs Cherryman	As Above	As Above
17, Malthouse		
Lane		
Mrs Christmas	As Above	As Above
109, Guildford		
Road		
Mr Birmingham	As Above	As Above
2, Meadow Way		
Mr Wyatt	As Above	As Above

11, Benner Lane		
Mrs Wyatt	As Above	As Above
11, Benner Lane	718718878	710712000
Mr Alleway	As Above	As Above
39, Common	710710070	710710000
Fields		
Mr Drew	As Above	As Above
13, Benner Lane	ASABOVC	A3 A00VC
Mr Fishwick	As Above	As Above
27, Meadow Way	718718878	710712000
Mr Emmett	As Above	As Above
15, Benner Lane	718718878	71071000
Mr Wells	As Above	As Above
22, Benner Lane	718718878	71071000
Mrs Wells	As Above	As Above
22, Benner Lane		
Mrs Smith	As Above	As Above
20, Benner Lane		
Mrs Berge	As Above	As Above
44, Guildford		
Road		
Mrs Holt	As Above	As Above
19, Jenner Lane		
Mr Patel	As Above	As Above
West End Stores		
Mr Smith	As Above	As Above
2, Westside Court		
Brentmoor Road		
Mr Lamberth	As Above	As Above
8, Bolding House		
Lane		
Mr McNamara	As Above	As Above
34, Oakridge		
Mr Incher	As Above	As Above
25, Oak Ridge		
Mr & Mrs	As Above	As Above
Robinson		
Roebuck Farm		
Cott		
Halebourne Lane		
Mrs Hampton	As Above	As Above
1, Westside Court		
Mr Hampton	As Above	As Above
8, Meadow		
Cottages		
Mr Daborn	As Above	As Above
50, Fellow Green		
Mr Valentine	As Above	As Above
3, Cuckoo Lane		

14.0	A - A	A - A /
Mr Gray	As Above	As Above
Allandale	A - A - A	A = A = = = =
Mr Wilkinson	As Above	As Above
Bagshot Road	A	A a A b a v a
Mr Hazell	As Above	As Above
20, Meadow Way		
Mr West	As Above	As Above
14, Camelia Court		
Mr Wicman	As Above	As Above
Mrs Arnott	As Above	As Above
Mr Jones	As Above	As Above
Kings Road		
Mr & Mrs Lee	As Above	As Above
8, Old Acre		
Mrs Mosely	As Above	As Above
10, Old Acre		
Mr Simpson	As Above	As Above
16, Old Acre		
Mrs King	As Above	As Above
22, Old Acre		
Mrs Jones	As Above & It would especially	As Above
Longfield	relieve congestion when children	
Fairfield Lane	walk to school, as you want more	
	children to	
	walk to avoid extra traffic in	
	general.	
Mr & Mrs K R	As above	As above
Young		
19 Oldacre		
Mr I Rogers	As above &	As above &
11 Old Acre	There is severe congestion around	Parking in the vicinity of
	Church Road junction with Streets	Church Road/Sheets Heath
	Heath, when there is football on	can be looked at separately
	the green and parades at Gordons	to the scheme
	School take place together, or	
	other functions	
Mr & Mrs C	As above	As above
Peacock	7.5 45070	7.0 40070
13 Meadow Way		
Mr R L Wilson	Church Road should only be	Closures are acceptable
12 Streets Heath	closed if it were necessary and	providing there are justifiable
12 Oli CCIS I ICali I	commodious to the public.	grounds, and subsequently
	Family have used Church Road for	approved by the appropriate
	nearly 200 years.	Committee.
		Committee.
	Where will the replacement common land come from.	Common land issues will be
		Common land issues will be
	No importance should be given to	dealt with by SCC legal
	the statements of the Parish	department with the relevant
	Council as residents have a poor	landowners.
	opinion of it.	The Parish Council is a public

M H Owen	Object to current experiment	body and their views need to be considered.
M H Owen L Owen C K Owen 18 Oldacre	Object to current experiment, roundabout would be a better solution as it would re-open Church Road and relieve congestion on minor roads in village. Additional speeding traffic on Windlesham Road without a footway is hazardous for children.	As above & As in April report, SCC will review junction of Windlesham Rd & A319 although there is no increase in injury accidents at this junction or Windlesham Rd A roundabout would not in itself relieve congestion even if it were feasible. Improvements to Windlesham Road are in progress and
Mr J E Smith 20 Benner Lane	Postpone making a decision on a permanent Order until consultation taken place with residents to find an alternative (roundabout) and work up scheme into cost benefit proposals	more may be introdued. Various options were proposed at exhibitions and the safest option is the current scheme. Decision already postponed from 29 April 2004 for reconsideration at this Committee meeting
Mr J E Smith 20 Benner La & Mr R Crow Silver Birches, Bagshot Road	Postpone making a decision on a permanent Order until consultation taken place with residents to find an alternative and work up scheme into cost benefit proposals. Objection to the system of consultation.	Various options were proposed at exhibitions and the safest option is the current scheme. Decision already postponed from 29 April 2004 for reconsideration at this Committee meeting. Additional area for consultation was agreed by the County and Borough Members following the Local Committee of 29 April 2004.
Mrs E O Chown 31 Meadow Way	There is no footway in Windlesham Road, church has been islolated and hearses can't turn, suggests traffic signals or roundabout at Benner Lane junction	Various options were proposed at exhibitions and the safest option is the current scheme. Turning movements are included in the permanent scheme.

Mrs Jo Bune 5 Windlesham Rd	Increased traffic on Windlesham Rd used as the new rat-run, speeding over 30mph, no footway or lighting	Lighting improvements are programmed this financial year A new footway installed between High Street and Gordons School access was installed in April 2004. As in April report, SCC will review junction of Windlesham Rd & A319, and Windlesham Road to the village, although there is no increase in injury accidents at this junction
J Digby 6 Windlesham Rd	As above	As above
A Sheen 7 Windlesham Rd	As above	As above
D Fenn 8 Windlesham Rd	As above	As above
Mr & Mrs N Wolf 18 Streets Heath	Construct a small roundabout at A319/Benner Lane to slow traffic & ease access to Benner Lane & Church Rd Traffic calming to Benner La & Church Rd to reduce speeds Convert Windlesham Rd to oneway northbound	Various options were proposed at exhibitions and the safest option is the current scheme. Traffic calming is unlikely to reduce traffic volumes. Introducing one way on Windlesham Rd will force all traffic from Gordons School exit and residents onto the A319 junction unnecessarily, generating the potential for an increse in personal injury accidents.
Mr C Drew 13 Benner Lane	Experimental arrangement has not improved junction with the A319. Further studies needed to ascertain safety as traffic volumes have been displaced and increased in Benner Lane. Suggest closing Benner Lane outside Holy Trinity School	Experimental scheme has achieved objectives of reducing accidents at this junction. Traffic flow studies were detailed in the previous report and specify where the increases have occurred. Closing Benner Lane outside the school will introduce hazardous turning and could force through traffic onto Commonfields & Jenner Dr.
Dr D Johnson	Current scheme has reduced	There have been no recorded

The Old Forge,	accidents drastically of slow	injury accidents at the
Bagshot Rd	moving traffic.	junction since the
	Does not solve problems of high	experimental scheme was
	speed collisions, suggest reduced	implemented.
	speed limit.	
	Suggestions to install a	A 40mph speed limit was
	roundabout will encourage more	implemented on the A319 on
	use of Benner Lane and make	28 May 2004.
	traffic outside the school	
	increasingly unsafe.	A roundabout could make the
	3,7	junction more attractive to rat
		running traffic.
Mr J G Murdoch	Supportive as safety benefit	Experimental scheme has
38 Commonfields	outweighs minor inconvenience.	achieved objectives of
	Current scheme reduces the	reducing accidents at this
	confusion to exiting traffic as to	junction for reasons opposite.
	whether entering cars will enter	βιποιιοπ τοι τοι σοισοπο οργοσίασι
	Church Road or Benner Lane.	Various options were
	Reduces confusion as to	proposed at exhibitions and
		the safest option is the
	whether traffic exiting Church	current scheme.
	Rd or Benner La has priority	Carrent Scheme.
	A roundabout would be a	
	satisfactory alternative.	
Mrs W M	Supportive of the scheme as it	There have been no recorded
Patterson,	has improved safety for turning	injury accidents at the
Inverleith Bagshot	traffic and should be	junction since the scheme
Road	permanently closed.	was installed.
	Traffic estimated using	
	Windlesham Rd & Benner Lane	Traffic flow studies were
	appears to be over stated.	detailed in the previous report
	A roundabout would be a	and specify where the
	satisfactory alternative.	increases have occurred.
	There is no footway on	
	Windlesham Road which is	Various options were
	dangerous for pedestrians.	proposed at exhibitions and
	Vehicles turning left from Gordons	the safest option is the
	School into Windlesham Rd use	current scheme.
	entire road width.	
	onare road width.	As in April report, SCC will
		review junction of
		Windlesham Rd & A319
		although there is no increase
		in injury accidents at this
		junction or in Windlesham Rd
		during the trial scheme.
		during the that scheme.
		Gordons School are
		reviewing their access
		arrangements and SCC will
		continue to liase with them.

Mr N Hampton, 3 Church Road	Supportive of the scheme as it has improved safety for turning traffic and should be made permanent. Would support a roundabout but not if it delays a permanent scheme.	There have been no recorded injury accidents at the junction since the scheme was installed. Changes to the design are likely to delay a permanent scheme.
Mrs F Day Tringham Cottages, Benner Lane	Supportive of the scheme as it has improved safety for turning traffic and should be made permanent. Has reduced traffic speed entering junction and it is safer to exit. Some traffic ignores the signing at the end of Church Road.	There have been no recorded accidents at the junction since the scheme was installed. A permanent scheme will be engineered to better standards than is possible on a temporary arrangement within the existing confines of the highway.
Mrs P J Cooper Gryffindor, Church Road	Supportive of the scheme as it has improved safety for turning traffic and should be made permanent. Often heard 'near miss' screeching tyres that no longer occurs. Access to the church and playing fields now safer. Some traffic ignores the signing at the end of Church Road. New footway in Windlesham Rd now keeps school children off the road. Traffic using Windlesham Rd ignores junction priority at Church Rd. Change the priority and traffic calm Windlesham Rd.	There have been no recorded injury accidents at the junction since the scheme was installed. A permanent scheme will be engineered to better standards than is possible on a temporary arrangement within the existing confines of the highway. As in April report, SCC will review junction of Windlesham Rd & A319 although there is no increase in injury accidents at this junction or in Windlesham Rd.